

City of Middletown, New York

Common Council Meeting

March 4, 2025

ALL: -- of America and to the republic
for which it stands one nation under God
indivisible with liberty and justice for all.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Roll?

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Alderman
Tobin?

ALDERMAN SPARROW TOBIN: Here.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Alderman
Jean-Francois?

ALDERMAN JUDE JEAN-FRANCOIS: Here.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Alderman
Johnson?

ALDERMAN PAUL JOHNSON: Here.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Alderwoman
Wray?

ALDERWOMAN KATE WRAY: Here.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Alderman
Kleiner?

ALDERMAN GERALD KLEINER: Here.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Alderman
Green?

ALDERMAN ANDREW GREEN: Here.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Alderman
Witt?

ALDERMAN KEVIN WITT: Here.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Alderman
Masi?

ALDERMAN JOSEPH MASI: Here.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: President
Rodrigues?

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Here.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Quorum is
present.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES:
Correspondence?

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Nothing this
evening.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: All
right. For the good of the city?

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: For the good
of the city this evening we have our first
speaker is Rose Tobiassen.

ROSE TOBIASSEN: Thank you very much.
First and foremost, it's very encouraging to see
the work that's being done on O&W. I'm glad that
we are able to save a very historical building.

Number two, the second ward's clean up
is the week of Holy Thursday/Good Friday
religious holidays. I don't know if you want
debris out on the streets during Easter time.

Number three, several years back we had a meeting here in common council with regards to the deer population. It's gotten worse. Is there any thoughts from the city on what we could do to control the increasingly large population and all the new babies that will be coming in a few short months? So I just ask for your consideration to maybe holding some other type of --

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: We bring in the DEC every time this comes up and the DEC says we have to neutralize them in a spot where we can pick -- you know, pick them out. But the herds walk like seven miles a day. So we think you're -- we're doing anything, but we're really not. And we would have to continue doing it for a long time. And once we have that public hearing, people will hear it.

We have had it three times in 21 years because I know and it gets shot down. Jerry can tell you and it's -- you know, it's -- they will do it, but it's -- they have to come in and do it constantly to --

ROSE TOBIASSEN: It is a hazard drive through Presidential up there and I do know that

there are people out there feeding. And I understand. I have a compassion for the animals too, but that only creates more problems. So --

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: I agree.

ROSE TOBIASSEN: Do you --

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: We agree.

ROSE TOBIASSEN: Do you think, President Rodrigues, that then it's kind of a dead issue bringing in the --

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: We could bring it up. We'll -- you know, the DEC does a great PowerPoint presentation. They'll, you know, invite everybody from the public. They had a spot in the back of (Indiscernible) where, you know, they can do it. They lure them in. But again, the offsets is you're not going to stop the deer from Mount Hope when they get here.

ROSE TOBIASSEN: Oh, no.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: And they cross seven miles a day they said. So like you're not going to stop them from coming.

ROSE TOBIASSEN: Thank you for whatever you can do.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Yeah.

ROSE TOBIASSEN: And --

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: We'll look into it.

ROSE TOBIASSEN: -- thank you for listening to my concerns.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Thank you.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Nobody else has signed up for the good of the city.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Okay. Remarks of department heads, Economic Development?

DIRECTOR MARIA BRUNI: Good evening, everyone. I just want to thank the council, I just want to thank the council, the mayor, council president for supporting the various public authority agencies that we have in the city of Middletown, and one of them is the IDA, which this past weekend on social media and some news called into question the integrity of the Middletown IDA.

So I think this was a political ploy, but you know what? Let me speak about the good work of the IDA and it's integrity. So the IDA

promotes public benefit. It's a public benefit corporation authorized by the state of New York to promote economic development, sustainable growth, general prosperity for the people of the city of Middletown by encouraging location, expansion, retention, and bringing in diverse businesses using incentives, rights, and powers in the efficient and cooperative manner.

The board is made up of seven members of the local community, which are all volunteers appointed by the mayor and approved by the common council. IDAs are required to hold public hearings before approving any project. IDAs must annually conduct an independent audit and a report -- and report their operations and activities to the New York -- to New York state for review.

IDAs can offer several benefits to private companies to incentivize them to relate -- relocate and to expand in our city. We are legally empowered to acquire, own, and dispose property. We are a conduit for financing through the issuance of tax-exempt bonds through banks and brokers who are able to provide property abatements, tax abatements for projects in

accordance with the -- our UTEP policy, Uniform Tax Exemption Policy, and apportions recaptured through PIOLOTs. PILOTs payment in lieu of taxes.

IDAs are eligible for exemption from state and local sales tax on purchasing -- purchases during construction and equipping a business.

So I'm going to go through seven projects that we've done. The Danza Leser Group, the former Horton Hospital. Everybody knows that the former Horton Hospital was here for years, didn't pay any taxes to the municipality. They expanded and grew about three miles down south -- down East Main Street to Garnet -- now known as Garnett.

So what are you going to do with a 360,000-square-foot building right in your city? Council President, Mayor, Council attracted Touro University College back in 2013/'14.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: It was just me and you. The mayor wasn't in office yet. We took the ride.

DIRECTOR MARIA BRUNI: So Touro University offers master's program now in

disciplinary sciences, the OMM clinic, and dormitories. So this was a private sale from a non-profit owner, which paid no property taxes like I mentioned, and sold to a developer. The current PILOT, Payment In Lieu of Taxes, the IDA was able to provide a PILOT sales tax exemption. Currently they are paying now about \$151,000 a year.

Now, this is -- increases every year and the PILOT is going to end in 2028 and then they're going to realize full taxation. So the project currently has 144 full-time equivalent employees, plus just this past year in '24 they reported 47 new jobs because they were doing other -- the other programs in the building along with the dorms.

Touro, since the inception of the PILOT, the IDA PILOT, created 407 construction jobs. This is all reported to New York State. We do an annual audit every year that they fill out for us, they return to us, and we have to supply New York State with all these numbers.

Next, Equilibrium Brewery Number I. This was right here -- back here 22-28 Henry Street.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Maria, just go back. Touro College was six -- they spent \$65 million --

DIRECTOR MARIA BRUNI: Thank you.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: -- rehabbing that building. \$65 million and making it our first medical school.

DIRECTOR MARIA BRUNI: Thank you. So here was another building empty, sitting empty, derelict right, like I said, back here. City had ownership of it. It was tax exempt for a little while, and then sold to a new business for 260,000, which included development goals under economic development.

We offered -- they went through the process of applying for IDA benefits. The current PILOT payment is 7,601 and it increases annually. This project currently has ten full-time equivalent employees at this location. And then PILOT, it began in '15 and it's going to expire next year in '26 where we'll realize full taxation. Again, another vacant building now prospering.

They grew so much that they had to expand. Of course, we wanted to keep them here.

So Equilibrium started in Middletown. We wanted them to expand in Middletown, not go somewhere else. So the city had ownership of the former TD Bank, which we purchased to save all the parking around it, the parking. Because of the downtown, because of the Paramount Theater, we needed their parking.

So we subdivided the property and sold to Equilibrium II. It was just the right timing as they were expanding. Sold for 650 with development goals to a business, again expanding. Current PILOT 17,000 and change. Increases annually. This project currently has 27 full-time equivalent employees at this location.

The PILOT began in '19 and will realize full taxation in 2028. That's only three years away. Again, another empty building and now it's just amazing what they do there.

Another brewery, all right? In our community, in our little community of now 30,000 we have two breweries. Heritage Restoration Properties, 14-22 Cottage. City had acquired this, another derelict building sitting empty just about a city block. Sold for 525 with development goals. Current PILOT is 12,000,

began in 2017, and will continue through 2025.

In 2026, that PILOT is going to realize 50 percent of full taxation and increase every year after by approximately five and a half percent of full taxation through 2035. This project as of 2023 had -- has 40 full-time equivalent employees and the property includes four residential apartments.

Next Poly Craft Industries. So we have manufacturing also as part of our IDA. This is a private sale, again private, to a business that is relocating from Long Island. This is in the industrial area. There was a building there that sold that was a former oil I believe, right? So they sold and they're adding an 80,000-square-foot building as you could see in the picture. That's the new building that they're adding to the location.

The current PILOT payment is 74,000 and change, which is equal to the current taxes that it was. So you cannot -- with PILOTs, you cannot go below what the current taxation was. So they're at 74 and change, and upon completion the PILOT will increase an additional 10 percent of assessed value each year, which will equal to

about 93,000 and change over the year.

Construction jobs are being created. A total of 171 construction jobs are expected by construction completion. With this project, they have a labor project agreement, which we have a third-party consultant doing the inspections. So the IDA hired a third-party consultant who's doing -- making sure they're monitoring the jobs, making sure that they're following our labor policy agreement.

Approximately 85 full-time equivalent employees are expected to be hired immediately, and it's expected to increase to 120 jobs within two years. PILOT began in '25 and is due to expire in '35 when it will resume and see full taxation.

We also assisted with assisted living facilities. So the Promenade SML Group down on Fulton Street, again another private sale of -- from one assisted living entity to another. Their current PILOT is at 50,000 per year. They have 37 full-time equivalent jobs are created, and the PILOT is due to expire in 2033.

South East Towers. This one, affordable senior living. There's 106 affordable

rental units for seniors. They went through the IDA process not only for a PILOT but also bonding. They purchased and renovated with 7.4 million in tax exempt bonds obtained through local banks. IDA does -- when we bond, we don't give money. There's the tax process, the sales -- the tax-exempt process, and also they go through private banks, private financing. We do not finance. IDA does not finance with funds.

The current PILOT is at about 95,000 in annual payments that increase each year. This particular project had construction jobs, but also it has -- four full-time equivalent jobs have been created. But it's providing 106 affordable rental units for seniors. That's the important key.

So this is just a summary that the City of Middletown in new PILOTs on formerly tax-exempt properties is seeing about 188,000 a year. 218,000 and change to the City of Middletown in PILOTs on manufacturing, affordable senior rental housing, assisted living. So the PILOTs bring in about 406,000 a year. PILOTs are designed to bring projects up to full taxation over time and generally expire 10 to 20 years.

So this is just a little background. Since 2007, there's been 1,061 FTE, full-time equivalent jobs, created. This year alone in 2024 we're realizing 2044 FTEs on active projects, 53 construction projects, and employment payroll at project properties in '24 is over 17 million. Again, these are numbers that are coming from the actual facilities projects that get reported to us that we have to report to the state.

I want to thank our board members. They're volunteer board members. Our Chairman Dave Madden, our Vice Chairman Wayne Hawkins. I know -- I believe one of our members here tonight Anthony Cantoli, and I want to thank Leonora our treasurer, the city's treasurer. She's on our -- as agency staff, and Patty Racine, the secretary. I want to thank them for all their commitment and their time to the Middletown IDA.

And we're very transparent. Meetings are public and held on the third Tuesday of every month 4:30 p.m. right here in this council chambers. They are also viewed live on Channel 20. You could go to our city website. Everything's posted there.

The New York State Authority's Budget Office, the New York State Comptroller, the New York State Department of Taxation and Finance, everything is posted there. Our reports, our audits, our budgets, everything is there. And that's it for IDA. I would like to put on my other hat, but if there's any questions before I go to my other hat.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: First of all, thank you for the presentation and certainly thank everyone that serves on the IDA in the ancillary positions. Thank you very much. So I guess I can assume, and you can correct me if I'm wrong, that an accusation by a no-show county legislator that there's no transparency and there's no auditing of the IDA is absolutely false. Am I correct?

DIRECTOR MARIA BRUNI: Absolutely false, yes.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: And the IDA does not gift any properties to anybody, correct?

DIRECTOR MARIA BRUNI: Correct.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Thank you. Anyone else? All right, Maria.

DIRECTOR MARIA BRUNI: Could I put my other hat on --

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Yep.

DIRECTOR MARIA BRUNI: -- for economic development --

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Go ahead.

DIRECTOR MARIA BRUNI: -- and small businesses?

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: That's what I called you up.

DIRECTOR MARIA BRUNI: We had two ribbon cuttings. One was at 156 Dolson Avenue, Don Julio. This was on Monday, yesterday. Great, great food, great Dominican Latin fare, beautiful people. We had a great time, and go check it out. It's just awesome food. 156 Dolson.

Also Resto Pa'm, new Haitian restaurant, 107 Academy Avenue. You have to go check this out. The food is amazing. And again, just great people, hard-working small businesses. Please support local, shop local, and that's all I have for tonight if anyone has any questions.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Anymore

questions? Thank you, Maria.

DIRECTOR MARIA BRUNI: Thank you.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Great job.

DIRECTOR MARIA BRUNI: Thank you.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: DPW commissioner.

COMMISSIONER JACOB TAWIL: Good evening, all. I'll be very brief tonight because you have your hands full. Alderman Masi, the drought. Our reservoirs are full about over 95 percent, which is very good. Just to let you know that the entire region is still classified in a moderate drought at this time because we had very little rain really to speak of. Tomorrow we're going to have quite a bit, but the entire region needs it.

I'll report to you next meeting about our ongoing projects, so I'm not going to mention them. I just want to mention one thing which is the reappointment of Deputy Commissioners Ross Mastria and Brian Smith. The mayor, he is not here tonight, but he suggested to put him in for reappointment for another three years. And the council president wanted to do that too, so it's

in your hands now the common council to approve the recommendation of the mayor and the council president.

And those two, Ross, he handles the Street department, the buildings that we own, the City of Middletown owns, and he handles Sanitation Department. And Brian Smith, basically all the snow plowing that you see every -- all the time and all that stuff, that's handled by Ross and his team. They're excellent team.

And then we have Brian Smith in there. He's in charge of the water distribution system and the waste water collection system, and the reservoirs as well. And that's -- you know, he's got his hands full maintaining all that. When you see all these text messages every other day or sometimes three times a day about water main breaks and all that stuff, that's handled by Brian Smith and our team in the water and the wastewater collection system.

So we appreciate those two guys. They're very instrumental and they're literally my right-hand man, both of them. I rely on them on everything with their teams, and we would

appreciate your support for reappointing them for three more years. With that, I will conclude my remarks. I'll report next meeting on all of our projects.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Any questions for Jacob? Alderwoman Wray?

ALDERWOMAN KATE WRAY: Considering how many requests I make of DPW, you guys sure you want to stay with us for three more years of this? Because I'm all for it.

COMMISSIONER JACOB TAWIL: Thank you very much.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: All right. Thank you, Jacob.

COMMISSIONER JACOB TAWIL: Thank you.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Acting chief?

ACTING CHIEF OF POLICE: I don't really have anything this evening other than I'll do a shameless plug for our upcoming civil service exam. The civil service exam will take place on Saturday, May 8th. The final registration date to get your paperwork into civil service is going to be at the end of the month March 31st. So we are looking for quite a few good men and women to

join our ranks in what I can comfortably say is the best police department in Orange County serving one of the safest small cities in New York state.

We have a great community that supports us, outstanding political leaders who work with us side by side to make sure we have everything we need, and make it a really excellent police office -- police department to serve with. So please visit our website. See -- download the application. Download the exam announcement We also have information on our Facebook page. We've partnered with a test preparation company.

You don't need to take the test prep course, but it does -- we've seen pretty good results because your civil service work does count as to how quickly we can reach you. Because that rank is based on your score. So we've partnered with Police Tutorial Services. The information's on our website. They'll give a discounted rate for Middletown residents of \$125 off that course.

So that course is scheduled -- it's a Zoom course. They provide written materials. They provide testing strategies and a whole bunch

of other things that will help you better understand the exam and hopefully put your best foot forward to score well. And that is taking place on April 13th. So you want to register for that.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES:

Alderman Masi?

ALDERMAN JOSEPH MASI: Yeah, I just want to correct one thing. The test isn't May 8th.

ACTING CHIEF OF POLICE: May 3rd.

ALDERMAN JOSEPH MASI: May 3rd. All right.

ACTING CHIEF OF POLICE: My mistake.

ALDERMAN JOSEPH MASI: No, that's all right. And the deadline is the 31st of March, so please -- at noon. So if you're interested, please get your applications in. Thank you.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES:

Alderman Tobin?

ALDERMAN SPARROW TOBIN: I saw there was a -- I think -- I believe a news story U.S. marshals on Grand Ave. Do you know anything about that? I just -- because I knocked on that door that Sunday.

ACTING CHIEF OF POLICE: So that incident -- any time that a federal agency operates in Middletown, they usually reach out for us. They were looking for someone with a warrant. That's their normal procedure. We did not assign personnel. They did not need our resources, but they did try and make contact with the individuals at the house.

Obviously in the current political climate, people mistook them. Federal enforcement thought there was ICE Immigration and that was not the case. It was just a simple criminal matter, federal criminal matter that the U.S. Marshal Service was working on. I don't think they located the individual they were looking for, but that was what that situation was.

ALDERMAN SPARROW TOBIN: Thank you.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: All right. Anyone else? All right. Thank you.
City clerk?

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Nothing this evening.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Any questions for the city clerk? All right. Public

hearings and grievances.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Good evening. We have a public hearing this evening. Notice is hereby given that the City of Middletown will hold a public hearing on Tuesday, March 4, 2025 on or as near to 7:30 p.m. as possible in the common council chambers to hear any and all persons wishing to be heard on proposed legislation regarding Good Cause Eviction.

All persons wishing to be heard will be given an opportunity to speak either for or against the proposed Good Cause Eviction legislation. The complete legislation is available in the Office of the Common Council Clerk at City Hall, 16 James Street and on the city website.

Persons unable to participate in person at the time of the public hearing may email comments to me at RMcCormack@MiddletownNY.gov. By order of the common counsel, Richard P. McCormack.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Okay. At this time the public hearing is open. I'm going to turn it over to Alderman Johnson.

ALDERMAN PAUL JOHNSON: Thank you, Mr.

President. For those of you new to the chamber, my name is Paul Johnson. I represent the Third Ward along with Alderwoman Wray. The conversations we've had about this legislation have been under the auspices of the legislative committee, which I chair, and that's why I'm flapping my lips for a few moments.

Community members, I call your attention to a couple of words in that statement "fair housing" and "the impact for stability for tenants and for the broader community".

There are generally considered to be two sides to this conversation. One would be the tenant side. I'll call your attention to the word "arbitrary", "arbitrary evictions". Some might actually characterize it as perhaps predatory. The concept there is that a landlord would not have the right to arbitrarily increase rent, you know, 10, 20, 30, 40 percent with a moment's notice and say, well, if you can't do that next month, you'll have to find someplace else to live.

We need to understand that does not represent rent control and it does not represent a landlord who can evict a tenant for not paying

the rent. This is not -- that's not the tenant we're talking about.

Well, what about landlords? Landlords have some rights as well. They have the right to look at fair market value if it changes over time. They have a right if they've made any capital improvements to kind of recoup their investment on what they've done with the property. And what we're doing as a council, and particularly administration, the mayor's studied this at great length, is to try to come up with a plan that is equitable for all parties.

There are lots of permutations and combinations to this conversation. What if you are owner occupied? What if you are month to month? There are lots of different things that don't fall into the general conversation that still have to be considered.

I got provided this list by Brahvan, who's one of the advocates for the tenants' group. These are the communities in the state of New York that currently have invoked Good Cause Eviction legislation. You'll see in that column it says one unit. The concept there is you want to make this as strict as possible to protect

tenants susceptible to Good Cause Eviction, and that means every landlord, even if you have one unit, would be susceptible to that.

The second column is FMR, fair market rent, and that would be -- some would categorize that as luxury apartments. It still says that even if you are paying a fair amount of rent, if you fall below that cap in those different communities, you are still eligible for Good Cause Eviction protection as long as you're staying less than 2 -- 340 percent or 240 percent.

And that is all I have to say, Mr. President. Thank you very much.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Okay. At this time the public hearing is now open. We'll open it up to the public. Rick will call your name up. You have three minutes to address the council for or against.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Our first speaker this evening is John Perrino.

JOHN PERRINO: Thank you, Mr. McCormack. Good evening, members of the council. Thank you, Paul Johnson, for inviting us here this evening. I'm here to speak not as a tenant

or a landlord. I'm here to speak as an educator. Almost 40 years in the field. Started at A.J. Veraldi in the mid-60s. A.J. Veraldi of course now is Middletown High School, about four or five times the size.

I support Good Cause Eviction, and I support this because as an educator, I -- from my experience, I have seen the effect of eviction on children, on students. I've seen students whose families were about to be evicted or were evicted. Their academics decline. Their behavior decline. There's a decline in their self-concept and general physical and mental health.

You know, one experience comes to mind. Clearly remember this. A student walked into the media center, had a complete and total meltdown crying and inconsolable banging her fists on the table. We had to involve the nurse. I think it was Gerri (Indiscernible) at the time. And administrator I think was Mike Edwards, guidance counselor Lori Orsley.

We did what we could. We contacted mental health. We contacted social services. Luckily one of the faculty members knew the

landlord and he did give them a grace period. But I don't believe that young lady was ever quite the same. So as I said, I'm in favor of this. And I know these are empirical observations, but my observations are backed up by a number prestigious journals. Youth Today, kids face the greatest risk of eviction of any age group. The consequences can last for a lifetime.

Pediatrics Perspective, the health impacts of eviction. Contemporary Pediatrics, eviction leads to harmful effects in young children. So you know, I just want to -- I'm going to finish now. I just want to quote from Frederick Douglass, 19th Century orator, abolitionist. He said it's easier to take care of the children than to fix broken adults. I'm paraphrasing that. And thank you. I'm done now. And thank you to President Rodrigues for letting me go so I can -- hopefully the concert's still on. Thank you.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Thank you.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Our next speaker is Janet Southerland.

JANET SOUTHERLAND: Good evening. As your Orange County legislator that does show up, I just wanted to commend the city council for holding this public hearing, for letting both sides be heard, tenants and landlords alike. I commend you and I appreciate what you're doing.

And just to the IDA, keep up the good work. Everything that you're doing here in the city of Middletown is incredible. We appreciate you. I appreciate you, the work that you're all working so hard to do to bring in the businesses.

And just a little sidebar. The deer coming from Mount Hope, congestion pricing may be -- above Euclid Avenue might be something to consider. Thank you.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Thank you.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Our next speaker is Jose Moran. Jose? Paula Martinez? Roxanna P.? Santiago Moran?

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Go ahead, Vanessa.

VANESSA: I think you're reading off the wrong list. I think you're reading off of either the supporters or the opposed. Because

the sign-in sheet started with someone different.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Oh.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: This says in favor.

VANESSA: No, no, no, but there was three pages, in favor --

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: I --

VANESSA: -- opposed, and sign-in to speak.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: To speak for the common council meeting.

VANESSA: Yeah. And the first name on that list was not Mr. Perrino that spoke. So I think you're reading off the wrong list.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Mmm.

(Simultaneous speaking)

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: We have them all. We have them all. He's reading off the names of the people that signed up. Who's next?

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Santiago Moran?

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Okay.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Kevin Gomez?

KEVIN GOMEZ: Good evening. Mr.

President, Chairman Johnson, distinguished members of the common council. First, I want to thank the city council for bringing -- or our legislative body for bringing into consideration this important piece of legislation and our administration's commitment to common sense public policy that is both fair and balanced.

I believe we are a community of both homeowners as well as tenants. In so doing to fairly and effectively address the concerns of both tenants and homeowners, I believe we must work together in partnership for the common good. Good cause, as the name states, is meant to help or lift people in society, particularly renters, by preventing an unreasonable and arbitrary eviction, as Chairman Johnson pointed out.

That is if you are a tenant fulfilling your contractual obligation of your tenancy, paying your rent, taking care of your tenement, in so doing contributing to the quality of life of your residents and community, you should not have to fear an arbitrary and unfair eviction.

New York state has already enacted Good Cause Eviction and under municipal home rule has extended to the municipalities like our own the

option to consider passing a law that is tailored to address our community's needs and concerns. And for these reasons I encourage the council, and I believe it is doing that by holding this hearing to ensure with clarity and specificity what may be the reasonable grounds for eviction and the unreasonable grounds for eviction.

Reasonable grounds, historically speaking, have been in violation of an obligation of tenancy, a nuisance, malicious or gross negligence, substantial damage to the property, occupancy in violation of the law, illegal use of the premises, or unreasonable refusal to access or necessary repairs.

Likewise, unreasonable causes for eviction may be lack of legal process, retaliatory actions, discriminatory practices, unreasonable rent increases, changing locks or removing tenant belongings without a court order, or shutting off utilities just to get rid of a tenant.

Second, the law should also specify the differences between a reasonable and unreasonable rent increase. And the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development, or HUD, has

offered guidelines to that effect.

Third, to have the law to -- that is effective and tailored to our community's needs, I think we must specify, and I believe, again, the City's doing that, what units will need to be exempt because of size, the right of owner-occupied residences, so that homeowners will have an incentive to rent out units as a contribution to the housing needs of our community and not see it as a detriment to either their finances or rights of the property owners.

And then fourth, we must take into consideration the public policy concerns, discouraging housing developments, potential for higher rents, overburdened court system, potential for tenant abuse, and the -- that's not what the law is about. The law is here to help us all, I believe, and not hurt instead.

I believe that the proposed bill as it stands is being carefully drafted to meet these concerns. And then we will be able to pass here a law that will not only serve all our residents' needs, but be an example to other municipalities that, working together, we can make a difference. Thank you.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Thank you.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Vanessa Cid?

VANESSA CID: Okay. Good evening, everyone. Vanessa Cid with For the Many, who I've been organizing with for the last seven years. And I live in the Second Ward. I have -- born and raised here I'm here today to speak in support of Good Cause Eviction. We need this law to protect against unfair eviction and predatory rent increases.

If folks pay their rent, abide by the law and their lease agreement, they should not have to face the threat of eviction or predatory rent increase. I also call on you to set the portfolio size exemption to one unit in order to cover as many tenants as possible under the law.

This way Good Cause can, like I mentioned, cover as many tenants and avoid corporate landlords exploiting this as a loophole by creating multiple LLCs. I must emphasize corporate landlords who do not live here, do not contribute to our community in any which way, shape, and form. The causes for eviction would very much still be unpaid rent, destroying the

property, or breaking a lease agreement.

At For the Many, we have a hotline to connect folks to resources in their community that are facing either eviction or rent hikes. I cannot express to you all the amount of calls we get of people being told by their landlords they will not allow them to renew their lease unless they sign to agree a \$250 increase. There's a goofball who commented on a local Facebook group page saying if they can't afford to live in their home, they should just apply for government assistance.

I don't need to go so long and far into explaining what we are seeing that is currently happening with our federal government and the already-lack-of services available to our community. My husband, we have friends and family that work for the same company where, thankfully, he's on a higher position with much better pay while his co-worker in the same position, same salary was just priced out of Middletown and couldn't renew because his rent reached \$2,100 on Lake Street.

A single mother living at Park Hill Apartments behind the post office and works at

the hospital who is in a union and also on Section 8, her rent was increased \$100. She went to the leasing office to ask why her rent was increased by this much when there had been no improvements done in her apartment. The woman in the office responded, "What do you care? You're on Section 8."

The tenant responded, "I still have to pay 30 percent of that." It's time we as a community protect each other, such as passing strong legislation like this. Beacon, Poughkeepsie, Newburgh, Kingston, New Paltz, and Fishkill have already done so. We don't need this to be strict. We need this to be strong.

Now I want to touch on what occurred on Thursday on Grand Avenue. If community members were not present to question why these agents were there, they would have already kicked down the door without a warrant. They finally left because they realized that the person that they were looking for in fact was not the person residing in this home.

I hope you all take the necessary steps to pass a law to protect our community and these predatory rates. Thank you.

(Applause)

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Next speaker is Bravin. Is it Rogan?

BRAHVAN RANGA: (Indiscernible).

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Rogan. I'm sorry.

BRAHVAN RANGA: My handwriting's not too good, so... Good evening. My name is Brahvan Ranga. I'm the political director at For the Many. I want to first thank this council and the mayor for advancing Good Cause legislation and for this public hearing. In particular want to thank Alderman Tobin and Alderman Johnson for their work on this legislation.

Local governments have been empowered by the state to protect tenants by opting in to Good Cause Eviction. And while much of the Good Cause law is determined by state statute, the city does have the power to determine if Good Cause is a comprehensive policy to address the housing crisis and protect tenants or be so full of loopholes and exemptions that it is rendered ineffective.

As such, I urge Middletown to set a portfolio-size exemption at one unit. Truly

small landlords who live in their buildings are already exempt from Good Cause as per the state law. So far, 14 out of 14 municipalities in upstate New York have set a portfolio-size exemption at one unit. If Middletown does any differently, it would be the weakest Good Cause Eviction law in upstate New York by creating an LLC loophole that corporate landlords could exploit and by exempting large swaths of tenants.

I also urge Middletown to set a high rent exemption at 345 percent of fair market rent to ensure that only luxury apartments are exempt from the law and to avoid a potential incentive for landlords to raise rents to try and get around the law.

I want to clear up a few misconceptions about this legislation. This legislation does not aim to be punitive towards landlords. Landlords have plenty of recourse to address problematic tenants through this legislation. Landlords can raise rents unrestricted in between tenancies, and good landlords already abide by what's in Good Cause. This law just seeks to codify their practices into legislation.

This bill does not apply to small mom-

and-pop landlords who live in their building. Good cause exempts owner-occupied buildings of ten units or less, and this policy does not limit the housing stock or make it harder for landlords to rent their apartments. That is a talking point that some opponents have used.

There is no evidence that this legislation limits the housing stock. New Jersey has had Good Cause on the books for years. They've outpaced New York and housing building. Fourteen upstate municipalities have opted into Good Cause. They do not have any problems with generating new housing stock because of this law.

What this bill has done is keep tenants in their homes. There's examples in Albany and in Kingston and in Poughkeepsie of tenants negotiating with their landlords to prevent rent increases sometimes of \$700 and to successfully use the legislation in court cases.

You know, in our current political moment, it can be easy to feel hopeless and wonder what power we have to protect our people. That's something that advocates like myself struggle with every day. But this council right now does have the power to protect tenants and

ensure Middletown can be somewhere we all afford to live, and I urge you to do so. Thank you.

(Applause)

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: William Grant?

WILLIAM GRANT: Good evening, ladies and gentlemen. Thank you for your time and attention tonight. I made a few notes today, but I just wanted to preface my words with that I feel like this is really a tip-of-the-iceberg representation here tonight.

I work side by side with a lot of people like myself that are struggling to keep up with the rental situation in the city of Middletown. It's sort of been vectoring, you know, in an upward trend for a long time, but nothing we've really seen like the trends in the last four to six years where there's sort of been a strong inflationary environment for better or worse, necessary or unnecessary.

So a lot of us are feeling the hurt of just trying to put those nickels together at the end of the day and make it work for our lives. I'm among them, and I don't think that when we see terms like "affordable housing" in our city a

resident, a tenant should have to work two to three jobs to keep up with what is defined as affordable housing. That's one of my points that I'm trying to get across tonight, and I think it's on the board with a lot of people that are here in this room.

In addition to that, the idea of this Good Cause law, I see it as an addition or almost like a supplement or amendment to our current guidelines and laws that are in place in New York state as put forth by the attorney general's office. And by the way, if you don't have a copy of those guidelines, I would advocate for all tenants and landlords to please get a copy of that. It's available online. You can contact David Letterman at the regional attorney general's office in Poughkeepsie, who is also the consumer advocate for tenants' rights in our area.

We are definitely, you know, in a position to do something good on so many fronts here, and I see this as an opportunity for win, win, wins on so many levels. And I hope this moves forward in a way that we have the right people to back it. I don't have the time to take

off from my job on a regular basis, but I did do that tonight to be here to advocate for myself as well as people I work with side by side every day. But I do know there are people in place and in play that are here tonight and hopefully will be moving forward to back this play to get it to work.

And in addition to that, I'm going to move forward and just presume to close in sort of a salesman type. And let's say we're getting this done and ask the City to also consider possible, you know, supplements and amendments to the Good Cause to sort of clarify our own city environment. Because I stand here before you as someone who had a former landlord try to evict me illegally multiple times.

I stand before you as someone who is still reeling from a rent increase within the past two, two and a half years of 58 percent. So let's get this to work, everybody. And I thank you all for your time and attention. Appreciate it.

(Applause)

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Arzoni

Balderas?

ARZONI BALDERAS: Good evening, everybody. My name is Arzoni Balderas. Thank you for letting me speak today. This is an urgent request for legislation prohibiting ICE collaborating with law enforcement in our localities. I am writing on behalf of the community of the immigrants and the ally community of Middletown to formally request that the city council pass a resolution preventing Middletown Police from cooperating with Immigration and Customs Enforcement.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: This is only for the public hearing.

ARZONI BALDERAS: Oh.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: This is only for the public hearing.

ARZONI BALDERAS: Do you know when I can speak about this?

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: There was -- we already passed that side.

ARZONI BALDERAS: Oh. All right. Apologize. Thank you.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: All right. This is only for the public hearing right now.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Ben Surface?
Apologize if I didn't get that.

BEN SURFACE: You got it.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Is it
Surface?

BEN SURFACE: Yep.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Oh, all
right.

BEN SURFACE: Good evening, and thank
you all for this opportunity. My name is Ben
Surface. I'm the supervising attorney for the
Hudson Valley Justice Center. I -- our office is
in Newburgh, but I practice and represent tenants
in this courtroom just about every week. So I
was here at the last meeting on this issue and
shared some information about the, you know, one-
unit-small-landlord definition.

I also wanted to take this opportunity
just to share a bit of the on-the-ground
experience of what we see in housing court, and
specifically in Middletown. I think sometimes
these conversations can feel like these sort of
tenants and these sort of experiences of unjust
evictions don't really happen in the smaller
cities of the Hudson Valley, but they really do.

I was here just this last month with a tenant whose rent is entirely paid by a housing subsidy. They're a -- they have a disability. They live independently, but that organization that supports them fully pays rent to the landlord. And even though that rent has been paid on time in a check in his hand every month, that landlord decided he didn't want that tenant anymore.

This is a vulnerable person in the community. They're disable. They're a single father. And there was literally nothing I could do outside of pleading with that landlord's attorney to be patient to get him more time to find new housing, to get him more time to work with his subsidy provider to move to somewhere where he could live with dignity.

That is the status quo right now in the city of Middletown. If the landlord gives you the right amount of heads up and you've lived there for ten years and they say hit the bricks, as long as they follow the notice requirements there is nothing I can do. And so this does really happen. The same can be said for the rental increases.

The other additional piece I want to touch on is when it comes to what you're hearing about the LLC loophole. So that's not just a talking point. That's a real legal issue we face. It is common practice for landlords, corporate landlords and smaller landlords, to hold their properties in separate LLCs. It's not currently done as a malicious, cynical practice. It's just a fairly common business practice.

The issue when Good Cause is in play is that there is no right to discovery in an eviction proceeding. You do not have the right to come to court and say, okay, I know I'm being sued for eviction, I want to see all their paperwork so I make sure they're following the law. You do not have that right in housing court.

It is explicitly a summary proceeding and is designed to move fast. You don't have the right to ask the landlord to show you their books. So if a landlord is there saying I'm a small landlord, I've only got three units, Middletown's unit exemption is four, me as their -- that tenant's lawyer, I have to independently find evidence that they are lying before I can

get the court to consider whether or not that landlord is actually qualified for that exemption.

So that is one of the reasons the one-unit exemption is so important is that I, as a tenant's advocate, do not have the ability to show up in court and say, okay, maybe you only have three units. Prove it to me. The landlord can't say I only have three units, here are my three units, and I have no ability to say, Judge, I need a discovery order in order to actually show that that's true. So that is why this definition at one unit is so important. Thank you.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Jason Nietzsche?

JASON NIETZSCHMANN: All right. Good evening, everyone. My name is Jason Nietzsche. I live in Ward 4. It's nice to see your faces again. I've served the community as an outreach worker at Honor, our homeless shelter, and I've seen firsthand how working class families in our city are just one rent hike away from losing their homes. These people work hard, pay their rent, and still live in fear of

being priced out.

This is not just an unfortunate reality. It's become a crisis. In 2024, Orange County experienced a 37 percent increase in the unsheltered population compared to 2022, and an 18 percent increase in the sheltered population. Having participated in the point-in-time count alongside Middletown Police, such as Officer Thoelen and non-profit workers, I've seen how many unsheltered individuals go uncounted.

The count happens in the dead of winter when many find temporary refuge with family or friends to escape the cold. Once the weather warms and they're asked to leave, they return to the streets making homelessness appear less severe than it is and leaving many in need of long-term housing unseen.

Compounding this issue, people are facing extremely long wait times for housing. Many wait three to five years to secure housing through wait lists. Meanwhile, rents continue to rise. When people's basic needs aren't met, it puts a strain on our community's resources and safety. Good Cause helps create more stability keeping our community safer and stronger.

The state has given us an opportunity to act, and I'm here tonight to urge for your support. This law would ensure that tenants cannot be evicted without a valid reason and that any rent increase above 8.82 percent must be justified. We need to pass a robust version, which includes setting the portfolio-size exemption at one unit and the high-rent exemption at 345 percent of fair market rent.

This will prevent corporate landlords from exploiting potential loopholes, as you heard many times tonight. Moreover, this law would also empower tenants to request necessary repairs without fear of retaliation. I've encountered numerous families who hesitate to report poor living conditions because they fear eviction. This law would provide them with the security to assert their rights.

Other cities, as you know, in our region, they've already enacted Good Cause Eviction. Now it's Middletown's turn. The state has granted us the authority to act. Let's seize this opportunity, protect our community, support Good Cause Eviction, and pass the strongest version of this law. Thank you.

(Applause)

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Our next speaker is Jairo Perez.

JAIRO PEREZ: Little tall. Good evening, council. My name is Jairo Perez. I'm with For the Many. I am also a homeowner that lives in the Fourth Ward. I'm a 20-plus year resident in Middletown, and I want to take this time to speak in support of Good Cause Eviction.

Before I do, I want to personally thank the mayor and the council in their work on getting this public hearing on the books. It's also great to see a council that works together. We need Good Cause Eviction to protect people from unfair evictions and predatory rent hikes. I've seen many of my friends that I've grown up with leave Middletown because they couldn't afford to live here anymore, people who would've loved to have a family and give back to the community.

That's what drives me to speak in support of this law. I want to keep families in their homes. If people pay their rent and abide by their leases, they should not face that threat of eviction or a predatory rent hike. I also

please ask you to set the portfolio exemption size to one unit in order to cover as many tenants as possible under this law.

This wouldn't be unprecedented as many of -- who've come before me have said as others say these have already adopted this version of Good Cause Eviction. Cities like Albany, Kingston, Poughkeepsie, Beacon, Newburgh, Hudson, Fishkill, and many more. Middletown needs to keep families here. Middletown needs Good Cause. Thank you.

(Applause)

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Naomi Dana?

NAOMI DANN: Hi. My name's Naomi Dann. I'm the chief of staff at Housing Justice For All, which is a statewide coalition of tenant and community organizations. We are part of the fight to pass Good Cause at the state level, and we work with groups that work with tenants here in Middletown.

The new state laws empowers municipalities to adopt these essential protections. We wish it had been applied universally. It wasn't, and so now it falls to you to make this decision. Other Hudson Valley

communities have already adopted these protections. As you've heard, it's cities like Kingston, Poughkeepsie, and Newburgh, but it's also towns like Fishkill and villages like Catskill and Nyack and Croton. We are hoping to see many towns in this region adopt it in the coming months as well.

Good Cause empowers tenants to negotiate the terms of their lease renewals to lower exorbitant rent hikes and protect people from arbitrary and retaliatory evictions as you've been hearing. In Albany, the first city to adopt Good Cause, tenants have already used it to push back against rent hikes of up to \$650 a month, and they were able to reach a negotiated agreement that included a reasonable rent increase, but one that would allow them to stay in their homes.

It's a very low bar, honestly, for reasonable conduct from landlords. For most landlords that are raising the rent a little bit every year to cover their increases in costs, this is not going to change their business model or how they rent out their properties. They'll still be able to evict people for non-payment,

for damage, for nuisance if they want to take the unit back for their own use. All of these good causes are enumerated in the law, and they'll still be able to raise rent annually a substantial amount to meet changes in their costs and continue to turn a profit.

What this policy is designed to do is to discourage predatory corporate landlords whose business model is predicated on buying up properties and pushing out the current tenants in order to rent it out at a higher rate to somebody else to make more profit. The new state Good Cause Eviction law authorizes municipalities to opt into these protections, but it also imposed many exemptions.

In the negotiations there are many carve-outs for the law that unfortunately the city of Middletown is not able to change. But there are some provisions that the city can take action to change, like the ten-unit portfolio exemption, which was an exemption designed for New York City.

Given that the state has already imposed other exemptions, like exempting owner-occupied buildings with fewer than 11 units,

units that were built in the last 30 years, or units that already are covered by other kinds of regulatory agreements, I would urge the City of Middletown to take advantage of the flexibility in the law to design it to meet your local needs.

The most important thing is that Middletown should set the portfolio exemption at one unit. Any larger portfolio exemption will make it extremely difficult and maybe impossible for tenants to know that they have these rights and be able to exercise them.

If you rent one unit in a duplex, you don't know how many other properties your landlord might own and it would be impossible to find out. And you would never know that you had these rights.

(Applause)

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Joe Finneran?

JOE FINNERAN: Good evening, everyone. Thank you for coming here tonight. I want to try to speak as quickly as I can. I've got some notes here. My -- now I understand some of the people that are opposing it. You know, it's for more of they're pulling your heartstrings I feel like. They're very nice people. The kids don't

want to get evicted. I understand all that.

But the morals and the economics of this doesn't make sense, meaning I can't control what this is going to cost next year. I can't control what a hot water heater's going to cost next year or a piece of siding or a plumbing. Are we going to cap what Steve Dodd or Val Bruni charges to put a new hot water heater in?

Are we going to cap what the insurance premiums -- they've gone up. Are we going to cap what they can charge? Are we going to cap what the water and sewer is? Are we going to cap all that? So it might be sad when some people get evicted, but the economics don't make sense to that.

Also, I wanted to point out that renting, everybody knows when they rent that it's a temporary thing. The definition of renting an apartment is temporary. It is not perpetual. With Good Cause Eviction you cannot evict somebody for infinity as long as they pay the rent and don't violate the lease.

Now, I had a tenant recently assault somebody else. It's not in my lease that you can't assault people. We can't have every little

thing in our lease. If a tenant is good and cooperates and pays their rent, most landlords, they let them stay. It's easy money coming in. When they start giving us a lot of grief or they're acting out or this, that is when we don't want to deal with them anymore.

Good Cause -- renting to somebody shouldn't be stronger than a marriage. Meaning if you guys are married, you can wake up one day and say this isn't working out, I'm fighting with my wife or my husband. In Good Cause Eviction, it does not matter if you're arguing with them. I am forced to do business with these people for the rest of my life, which just is not fair I don't think. It's just not fair.

It's -- another thing I wanted to point out was that also if I wanted to sell my home to a homeowner -- I know you guys want more homeowners, a single-family residence. If the tenant is there, I'm not able to do that. The only person that will be able to buy that home then is only the person living there, the renter.

Since -- in the Good Cause Eviction, I cannot evict these people if I don't have a good cause. Meaning if I want to sell the house to

somebody else or somebody wants to buy my property, that is not allowed under Good Cause Eviction. So that property, the value has -- will go down tremendously, probably all over the city of Middletown I'm expecting. So with that being said, I understand what they're saying, but the morals and the economics of property ownership and what things cost don't make sense.

Trump just put 25 percent tariffs. How do you think Home Depot prices are going to be in the next year? That's all. Thank you, everybody.

(Applause)

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: And next speaker is Anahi Moran Alvarez. Jose Hernandez? Valerie White? Did I --

WOMAN 1: (Indiscernible).

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Just go to the next one.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Marlene Lang? White, Hernandez. Tom Grazier?

TOM GRAZIER: Hi. Good evening, everybody. I've been a landlord here in Middletown for 20 years. I have two properties. I take care of my properties. Basically, we're

your first line of defense at keeping this community full of people who want to contribute. I'm not talking about poor people, handicapped people. I'm not talking about people who are different. I'm talking about those people doing harm to our investments without -- with malice and without regard to cost, cause, or unrest for other tenants and our sales and dealings, and those that, after attempts to remedy issues have failed, have deemed they are incompatible with us or other tenants, like this other gentleman was saying. He got into a fight with somebody.

I've never removed anybody who was a good tenant or because his views, customs, and cultures are different than mine. Only as a last resort have I ever removed anybody and asked them to leave. Removing a tenant is the last thing myself and any landlord wants to do. Besides always having a loss associated with turning the unit over, missed rents and possible legal fees, we are in the rental business and not in the business of leisurely removing people for any whim.

If just cause is passed it will give even greater rights to people who are already

protected on so many levels through federal and states laws or mandates. Then also instead of removing someone before they are a major issue, we'll be forced to wait until they stop paying rent, break the lease in any other way, or worse, commit crimes against us or other people thereby opening me and my wife to even greater loss by way of being named in a lawsuit.

It could be crushing to what we have worked so hard to obtain these last 20 years. Let's see. Where am I? How much time have I got left? A minute and 29. Okay. I've put up -- let's -- want to get rid of that. No, no, no. Okay. So, listen, in conclusion, if the City of Middletown, the state of New York, the United States wants to have all these tenants with Good Cause Evictions clauses and give them permanent housing and take up, you know, whatever stuff they may dish out, I suggest you guys do that, okay?

Have places where you can rent to anybody for below market value or whatever you guys want to do, you know? Put up with the lawsuits. Put up with the grief. Put up with all the problems that tenants can be, and just

make it so that I'm not subsidizing the state of New York on their mandates. I mean, this whole "I have to take Section 8 people", it's crazy, okay? It's absolutely crazy. I am taking Section 8 people, and I am subsidizing the state of New York by giving them homes, okay? And yeah, I do. I do subsidize Section 8. I subsidize every single person -- every -- the state of New York.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: You're out of time.

TOM GRAZIER: All right. Good bye. Have fun.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Thank you.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Brian Conner?

BRIAN CONNER: Good evening. My name is Brian Conner. Thank you, everybody, for coming in tonight. I'm a local landlord here in Middletown. From what I've been hearing tonight, you know, a lot of concerns on both sides of the aisle. I've been a landlord in Middletown since 2012. And from my experience, sitting in this rooms hundreds of times, it's very rare that I hear a case that is being taken through where

it's a very good tenant who is just being evicted simply because the landlord wants to get him out.

Now, maybe that's because those cases don't make it to court. However, if I were to estimate we've done about 75 evictions since 2012, of those 75 evictions, 73 of them have been from non-payment of rent. Only two were for other causes. Typically tenants are evicted for non-payment. They're not evicted because rent increases.

Another point I'd like to make is, as a landlord, we typically set our rents based on Housing and Urban Development, which puts out rent for every single state and every county in the nation. Although I understand that rents have increased dramatically in the past five years, six years since before COVID, I would ask you to look towards your federal government into the Housing and Urban Development Agency and look at what they have increased their fair market rent from 2019.

So as landlords, we are simply taking direction from the federal government as to what fair market rent is. Also, as many people have said here tonight, you know, I think it's a

difference kind of between corporate landlords and smaller landlords. I agree nobody's rent should ever go up \$600 a month. But the unfortunate part of Good Cause Eviction is many municipalities have passed it with a rent control. If a rent is \$1,500 a month and the fair market is 2,000, at a rent control of 5 percent, it's going to take me 9 years to get to fair market. In those 9 years rent will obviously go up. Therefore, I will never be able to catch fair market rent.

Good Cause Eviction scares a lot of landlords. And from what I just said, we are looking at raising rents to get ahead of this rather than falling behind. Thank you.

(Applause)

MAN 1: I don't want the timer to start yet. I just want to say thank you to the common council. If the mayor was here, I'd thank him about that, about the beautiful street lights in the city of Middletown. Maria, you too. The beautiful street lights, the beautiful sidewalks we're having around town. I dearly appreciate that. The town is changing for a better place for all of us. If I could say that to start this

off. And can we start that clock over now? No.

So I'm a lifelong resident of the city of Middletown. Many of you know me because I also am part of a communication company in another way of providing service for our customers. But I'm also a resident as an owner of a property, and I'm also an owner of several rental properties. I'm here tonight because I'm very confused. I heard some people come up and they were talking about evictions.

The eviction process is costly and very time consuming. Neither does a tenant or a landlord really want to go through, but in this very room they're taking place, and they have two of them right now. One is what you call an unintentional squatter. We're eight months in.

So when you're talking about Good Cause Eviction, I think I'm -- I need to figure out where this is. If you're not paying your rent, you're not paying your rent, then you should be evicted? Or is that the course we're -- as a landlord I'm supposed to take?

By the way, of the many years of being a landlord, I'm just recently doing my first two evictions. I've never come across this before.

I was always working with my tenants if there was some sort of a situation and they would move on or rectify it. So this is very hard for me to say that this Good Cause Eviction is something I had to really dig deep on.

With the amount of units, it's one unit and it should be more than one unit. Maybe 12 units that they should be capping it at or per a site. I just -- the eviction process is a very overwhelming situation and time consuming for both the tenant and the landlord. But is the Good Cause Eviction going to be taken advantage of like our eviction process today?

If I'm seven months on an eviction for non-payment of rent, eight months on an unintentional squatter, someone should explain to me what the layman terms of the Good Cause Eviction would be for the owner. When the bills aren't paid, that's what causes a landlord to become distressed.

As an investor in the area, I believe that the more people that buy here care about where they live by having ownership of a property as myself when I was 22 years old. I love the city for supporting that. I'm here as a lifelong

resident supporting that. This Good Cause Eviction might change some people's opinions on it. Thank you for your time again.

(Applause)

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Deb Habib?

LISA DIBBLE: (Indiscernible).

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: That's it.

LISA DIBBLE: I was just wondering if there was anyone else.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Nope, you're it. You're it. Oh. All right. Hold on, Deb. Go ahead. Come one.

WOMAN 2: (Indiscernible).

LISA DIBBLE: Good evening, everyone. Thank you. My name is Lisa Dibble. I am Cy's wife. We own I think seven units and a commercial property in the city of Middletown. I think I want to just reiterate the importance. These regulations could very much hinder landlords, and we could see a reduce in people who want to enter the market of buying rental property, especially if they have all these different laws restricting the things that they can do.

And what I'm also worried about, because I know that we keep our properties very well maintained, and I'm very concerned about other landlords within the city limits that may see this as a hinderance to their ability to increase their rents. And they might start letting their properties go. So you know, like Joe Finneran was saying, you know, cost of maintaining your properties and what have you, and them going up and have a restrict in rent increase.

That is one of my very big concerns. Like we see some properties still in the city of Middletown that are, you know, boarded up and -- you know, so I just wanted to add that, that it's a big concern. Are we going to see property owners just kind of let things go because they can't increase their rents or get a different quality tenant? Thank you.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Thank you. All right, Deb. Now you're up.

DEBRA HABIB: My name is Debra Habib, and I'm here also because I am a real estate agent and a broker-manager. And everything I'm hearing tonight is extremely important from both

sides. And what do I mean by that? There is Section 8 that's a mandated state law, as you well know, where every landlord must entertain Section 8.

As landlords, some people love Section 8 because it's a steady check every single month. Unfortunately, Section 8 had a very bad connotation many years ago where people just like, oh, you're Section 8, that's it. It is not that way today.

The other thing that I want to say is your property doesn't decrease at all if you are having a Section 8 tenant. Your property does not decrease in value at all. Tenants have to be protected. I totally agree. There's fair housing laws. There's all kinds of laws that protect tenants more so than they protect the landlord too.

You're hearing people today what about if all the costs increase, how am I going to recoup it if I can't increase my lease? Everybody has a lease. If you don't have a lease for your tenant, shame on you. There's a lease. You put a beginning date and an end date. It's not forever. Nothing's forever, okay?

So we are in control whatever you see, whichever side you're on. You're in control of the lease. You can -- at the end of your lease, you can do what you want with it. You can increase, do what you want.

I understand this better. I'm glad I heard everybody because I can sit there in the medium and say I understand both sides. And I think it's important to also realize that when you are -- there are laws that protect a landlord from bad behavior of a tenant. A squatter, the gentleman just said, that to me needs to be, you know, expelled, get out. You shouldn't have squatters in there, and we do have that problem too.

But every time we do a rental in my company, I can't tell you the amount of tenants online for that rental. We have an enormous amount of issue of not enough rental properties, and that's one of the things, you know, I want you to understand. There are people out there and they can't even afford, you know, the three months of security or the two months of security. That has to come out of their pocket. So I think we really have to work together to really try and

get help for these tenants too. I see both sides. Thank you.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Thank you.

(Applause)

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Anyone from the council? Alderwoman Wray?

ALDERWOMAN KATE WRAY: I think we might be having our wires crossed on what this legislation is and how people are receiving it. And I think we need to be clear that Cy mentioned, well, if you don't pay your rent, you're protecting people. If you don't pay your rent, you're getting evicted.

This law does not say you don't have to pay your rent anymore. Don't worry, no one can evict you. That's not what this law is doing. And as you said, the eviction process is long and arduous for a landlord. What's an easy way to get around that? I have one. Your rent's going up \$700 next month. If you can't afford that, get out. Oh, look at that. No more tenant problem. It's there because it protects people from having that rug ripped out from them.

In terms of increasing your rent, this

isn't saying you can't ever increase your rent. It's telling you, you can't increase it over a certain amount, a certain percentage where you have altered someone's life completely. That's -- we're not writing a law that says tenants can set up in your house and never move out. It's not --

WOMAN 3: (Indiscernible).

ALDERWOMAN KATE WRAY: I'm not having an argument. I'm just making a statement. That's not what this legislation is designed to do.

WOMAN 3: (Indiscernible).

ALDERWOMAN KATE WRAY: We're not -- it's not a time for a back-and-forth. Everyone's had a chance to speak, and I'm trying to explain where we're crossing our wires here. Okay? Because we're talking -- a gentleman spoke on, well, you know, the rates that people are getting for rents right now is 2,000 and I'm only charging 1,500. They're paying their rent on time. How do I get that money caught up?

Caught up to what? I'm a homeowner. I'm lucky. I have a mortgage. You know what? That payment stays the same. So does yours as a

landlord. You have a mortgage. It's not going up. So catching up to what?

(Simultaneous speaking)

ALDERWOMAN KATE WRAY: The bank isn't -- yes, I understand you are paying to maintain your property.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: We're not going to have back-and-forth.

ALDERWOMAN KATE WRAY: Thank you.

MAN 3: (Indiscernible).

ALDERWOMAN KATE WRAY: This is my opportunity to speak. You can disagree with me silently. I'm speaking because I am a homeowner. I understand what things cost. But you purchased the property as an income property, right? So these aren't just covering your mortgage. You're making that money and that's built in so that you can make repairs as they're necessary.

I've also just helped my daughter sign a lease for college next year. I know exactly how detailed these leases are and are able to be down to what you use in the building and what's being paid for. And if we don't want to pay for the increase in water, then your tenant pays for water. It's your lease to write on your property

and you can protect yourself by the way you write your lease.

And as Deb spoke, lease has an expiration date. When you come to the end of the lease, if this is no longer working for you, you have the right to not renew that lease. That is why we have a lease. Good Cause Eviction isn't going to say you can't end a lease. It's not going to say they don't ever have to pay their rent and they never get evicted. All the laws for property damage and non-payment of rent are on the books and maintained as they exist today for you as a way to evict bad tenants.

This is a way to protect good tenants, the tenants who are paying their rent just trying to survive and live in their home that is stable and not have the rug ripped out from under them arbitrarily as an easy way to move onto, as you said, how do I get to 2,000? Well, I'll tell them it's 2,000, they can't pay it, and I'll go find someone who will.

Because as we've learned from our real estate expert, there's a ton of tenants lined up. And they want to pay because they're looking for housing. And so you know you've got a market

that's saturated with people who need a place to live so you jack the rent up high enough because you know you can charge as the next one in line. And you've made someone else homeless. This is the purpose of this legislation.

We are not here to punish landlords. We're here to protect good tenants. If you're not a predatory landlord, then this is a non-conversation because you're already doing the right thing.

MAN 3: (Indiscernible).

(Applause)

ALDERWOMAN KATE WRAY: That's -- yes, they do. Yes, they do.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES:
Alderman Johnson?

ALDERMAN PAUL JOHNSON: Thank you. First of all, on behalf of the council I want to thank all of you for coming. You probably all have a lot of better things to do on an evening like this. But for me as a legislative chair, we've achieved the goal. I think we've had a very good representation of many -- not even two sides, but many sides of this conversation.

I think we have demonstrated this

evening it's not quite as simple as it looks at the first glance. We have already discussed the one property portfolio numerous times thanks to our gentleman in the back row, and we understand the nuance of that. When I say "we", I mean the administration. And I've been working with the mayor to try to get to tonight, which took a while, but we got here.

We also understand as Vanessa talked about and others the LLC, what we call the camouflage. So whatever the number is, I can work around that number. And when you kick the tires on that, you do find out that it is very difficult to define who that LLC is. So if you want to play sleight of hand, have at it.

Oh, let me see your LLC numbers. Well, lately that's not really something that I could have to provide to you in this conversation. Is that fair or unfair? Well, if you're doing it with a bad intent, it's not very fair at all.

The word "predatory" has come into this conversation many times this evening, and that's where this legislation is looking. We're not talking about "good landlords". We're not talking about "good tenants". We're talking

about when things go south. When things go south on the landlord side, yes, there is eviction. Yes, it can take a long time. Yes, you go to court and all of a sudden the bad tenant has more rights for another month or two or three to live in the dwelling.

But that's not really what we're talking about with this legislation. We're talking about somebody who's paid their rent for ten years and arbitrarily and capriciously the landlord says, well, you know what? We're going to go up 30 percent. You know, we talked about number 100, 600. It's not numbers, it's the percent.

I'm going to raise your rent 30 percent. Well, you know that I can't afford that. Ha, ha. You know what? I do know that. But anyway, you've got until the first of the month. That's the situation we're trying to protect. And we do that.

The last sentence in this dialogue says fair housing. As a council, we want to represent and maintain fair housing. We understand the landlords who invest in our community and invest in the portfolio of rentable housing are an

attribute to our community. But we also acknowledge that good tenants who work hard and pay their rent and keep up the property and send their kids to our schools and do almost every single thing they know they're supposed to do, we have to appreciate them as well.

But thank you all for coming. As far as what to expect in the future, we will probably have another committee meeting or two on this matter, and we probably will not come to any substantive legislation probably for the next six weeks just so you know. Because we meet every two weeks. Once again, thank you all. And on behalf of the council, I appreciate everything that each one of you has said.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: So at this time I'll keep the public hearing open just for written comments for the next two weeks. All right? Thank you. Moving onto remarks of aldermen. Alderman Masi?

ALDERMAN JOSEPH MASI: Nothing this evening.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES:
Alderman Witt?

ALDERMAN KEVIN WITT: Nothing this

evening.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES:

Alderman Green?

ALDERMAN ANDREW GREEN: Yeah. I just want to say that we're going to host our constituents meeting. We are going to hold one for March, and that'll be next Monday the 10th at 7 p.m. here in the council chambers. And I do also just want to thank everyone from either side of the aisle for coming here tonight and speaking.

We certainly know how difficult it can be to come up and voice your opinion in front of those who are opposing those who are with you. I know there's certainly a lot of questions I still have on this, a lot of legislation I'm reading, and I look forward to working with everyone both on the landlord side and on the tenant side and within our council to come to a good solution to this. So thank you.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES:

Alderman Kleiner?

ALDERMAN GERALD KLEINER: Thank you. I know everyone wants to go listen to the state of the union. Our constituents meeting, as Alderman

Green has said, Daylight Savings Time will start next weekend. So the sunset is at 6:59 p.m. So we're almost daylight when you get here. So it'll be a little dark still when you leave.

Very quickly, Dr. (Indiscernible) and Andy Mills are speaking at Thrall Library. And that's Sunday, March 9th. That's this Sunday at 1:30 p.m. And if you don't know who Moses Stivers is, Andy's his great-great-grandson. But he was many things in Middletown, and he ended up being a congressman. But that should be a very interesting talk.

Also for people who don't know, the biology professor ad hoc Professor Jan has been doing a series of free talks every Monday night in the rally center from 5:30 to 6:30. I think he just finished talk number six, but his lecture series is local wildlife and their prehistoric ancestors. He's an amazing teacher.

He's going to be talking about a lot of different things, but this whole schedule of his events is on the OC website under cultural affairs lectures. So I would just give one quote from Elon Musk who said, "The fundamental weakness of western civilization is empathy."

And I would like people to think about that.
 I've called him the biggest coward in the
 country. I think he's now the biggest evil
 coward in the country. But that's what we're up
 against, so good luck to all of us. Thank you.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES:

Alderwoman Wray.

ALDERWOMAN KATE WRAY: Good evening. I
 just wanted to shout out some of our youth today.
 I know a few of our boys wrestlers were on the
 podium at the state championships last weekend.
 So I just wanted to congratulate them on their
 successes and our students in Middletown High
 School and I believe also Monhagen were winners
 of their Odyssey of the Mind.

MAN 4: High school.

WOMAN 5: High school.

MAN 4: High school (indiscernible).

ALDERWOMAN KATE WRAY: High school --

MAN 4: -- (indiscernible).

ALDERWOMAN KATE WRAY: Presidential
 Park third. Okay. That's what I thought. And I
 just wanted to shout out those kids. I know
 they're always working after school and during
 their lunch periods and everything else. And I

just -- I think we have amazing youth here and it's worth mentioning their accomplishments as they have them. That's all I have tonight.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES:

Alderman Johnson?

ALDERMAN PAUL JOHNSON: Thanks. So for Mr. Musk, I know he's got the chainsaw running. He might not hear me, but I'd like him to think about apathy, sympathy, and empathy.

As far as the deer, the dear deer, I've been here for at least two of those. DEC comes down. How do they estimate the number of deer? Well, they look at deer poop and they have a formula, which is good for them. The last time we looked at it we were told we have five times more deer than we can accommodate.

Why do they populate in cities whether it's Mount Hope, whatever? There are no predators and there's a food supply. Even if you don't put out cracked corn, we all see deer munching on brown grass. They're doing the best they can.

As we came to the conclusion of that study, there was only one conclusion to that study, and that is to cull the herd. And it

seemed like every time we got to that, well, I don't want to do that. There was a program in Rockland County to actually inject the deer every year to render them infertile. Would you like us to do that? It's not really sustainable.

Girls tend to want to stay where they were born. Boys get pushed out except for the one that gets to stay. There's only one remedy to that problem, to cull the herd. And actually, in a city, the biggest damage is auto collisions and they do calculate that.

I also want to do a very brief public service announcement. There's been a lot on the news lately about Catholic Charities and what's happening or not happening. I happen to be friends with the director of the Goshen office. I called her today to say, well, what exactly is happening.

I was told that perhaps the substance abuse program may be kind of on the chopping block but that the vast majority of everything they're offering is still available. There may be a consolidation of locations. And Kristen Jensen is the director with whom I spoke, and I told her I would remind anybody listening if you

think you need to avail yourself of services, you should call 845-294-5124. And the odds are that you will be pleasantly surprised. Thank you.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES:

Alderman Jean-Francois?

ALDERMAN JUDE JEAN-FRANCOIS: Yes.

Good evening. DPW committee have met this evening. We are conclude that the directional changes on Prospect Street, that would be our next meeting. We have a resolution that would follow. And that's all I have this evening. Thank you.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES:

Alderman Tobin?

ALDERMAN SPARROW TOBIN: Thank you. I would also like to thank everybody for sharing their thoughts and concerns. I did hear I think -- I understand the homeowners and the rent apartments -- and I know you guys are all good landlords. I don't think applies to you. I think if you look at the law, it's -- the rent increase is five percent plus CPI, which is about three percent. So that's eight percent capped at ten percent.

So if you have -- are charging \$1,000

for rent, it's \$1,100 the next year, 1,200, 13, you could keep going. You could be up to \$1,500 in five years. So -- and it doesn't -- it's not -- if -- all the reasons why you can be evicted are still the same. If you don't pay your rent, you could be evicted. You damage the apartment, you could be evicted. You know, police are involved, you can be evicted.

This is for -- basically, I would think of it as like price gauging for people coming after people just to increase the rent because they can to push people out. If you improve your property, you can raise the rent based on your improvements. It doesn't prevent you from doing that. I believe if you want to sell your property, you can sell your property even if there's a tenant there. That doesn't prevent you from doing that.

So there's a lot of things. I encourage you to look at the bill. This is a watered-down version of Good Cause. I mean, what they sent to the state was a lot more -- what the tenants' advocates really wanted was a lot stricter. This has been -- there's been a lot of compromises already made -- put into this law.

So I'd just encourage you to look at the law. Please put into written comments if you have something else you'd like to say. We'll take that into consideration.

But I think a lot of the fears -- and I understand you have a lot of investments in there. And this doesn't apply -- I know a lot of you guys. You're great people. This -- you don't mistreat your tenants. We're worried about predatory price gauging on people that would take advantage of their tenants. So that's it.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Okay.
New business?

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Good evening.
We have a resolution sponsored by Alderman Masi authorizing the transfer of \$98,100 from the general fund balance for HVA system repairs at the Paramount Theater.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES:
Resolution sponsored by Alderman Masi, seconded by Alderman Kleiner. Any discussion? Roll.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Tobin?

ALDERMAN SPARROW TOBIN: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Jean-Francois?

ALDERMAN JUDE JEAN-FRANCOIS: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Johnson?

ALDERMAN PAUL JOHNSON: Aye. Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Wray?

ALDERWOMAN KATE WRAY: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Kleiner?

ALDERMAN GERALD KLEINER: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Green?

ALDERMAN ANDREW GREEN: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Witt?

ALDERMAN KEVIN WITT: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Masi?

ALDERMAN JOSEPH MASI: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: President

Rodrigues?

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Carries.

Resolution sponsored by Alderman Witt authorizing an agreement with the Office of Congressman Pat Ryan for shared office space in city hall.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES:

Resolution sponsored by Alderman Witt, seconded by Alderman Tobin. Any discussion? Roll.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Tobin?

ALDERMAN SPARROW TOBIN: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Jean-Francois?

ALDERMAN JUDE JEAN-FRANCOIS: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Johnson?

ALDERMAN PAUL JOHNSON: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Wray?

ALDERWOMAN KATE WRAY: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Kleiner?

ALDERMAN GERALD KLEINER: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Green?

ALDERMAN ANDREW GREEN: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Witt?

ALDERMAN KEVIN WITT: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Masi?

ALDERMAN JOSEPH MASI: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: President Rodrigues?

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Carries.

Resolution sponsored by Alderman Tobin authorizing a transfer of \$2,000 within the 2024 fire department budget for the year-end costs.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES:

Resolution sponsored by Alderman Tobin, seconded by Alderman Jean-Francois. Any discussion?

Roll.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Tobin?

ALDERMAN SPARROW TOBIN: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Jean-Francois?

ALDERMAN JUDE JEAN-FRANCOIS: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Johnson?

ALDERMAN PAUL JOHNSON: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Wray?

ALDERWOMAN KATE WRAY: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Kleiner?

ALDERMAN GERALD KLEINER: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Green?

ALDERMAN ANDREW GREEN: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Witt?

ALDERMAN KEVIN WITT: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Masi?

ALDERMAN JOSEPH MASI: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: President Rodrigues?

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Carries.

Resolution sponsored by Alderman Jean-Francois authorizing a proposal from Clark Patterson Lee for engineering and construction services for

roof replacement and repair at the Water Department garage and the Department of Public Works garage.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES:

Resolution sponsored by Alderman Jean-Francois seconded by Alderman Masi. Any discussion?
Roll.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Tobin?

ALDERMAN SPARROW TOBIN: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Jean-Francois?

ALDERMAN JUDE JEAN-FRANCOIS: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Johnson?

ALDERMAN PAUL JOHNSON: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Wray?

ALDERWOMAN KATE WRAY: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Kleiner?

ALDERMAN GERALD KLEINER: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Green?

ALDERMAN ANDREW GREEN: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Witt?

ALDERMAN KEVIN WITT: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Masi?

ALDERMAN JOSEPH MASI: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: President

Rodrigues?

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Carries.

Resolution sponsored by Alderman Johnson
authorizing a proposal from Strategem for
security upgrades at the Paramount Theater.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES:

Resolution sponsored by Alderman Johnson,
seconded by Alderman Jean-Francois. Any
discussion? Roll.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Tobin?

ALDERMAN SPARROW TOBIN: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Jean-
Francois?

ALDERMAN JUDE JEAN-FRANCOIS: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Johnson?

ALDERMAN PAUL JOHNSON: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Wray?

ALDERWOMAN KATE WRAY: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Kleiner?

ALDERMAN GERALD KLEINER: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Green?

ALDERMAN ANDREW GREEN: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Witt?

ALDERMAN KEVIN WITT: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Masi?

ALDERMAN JOSEPH MASI: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: President
Rodrigues?

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Carries.

Resolution sponsored by Alderwoman Wray
authorizing and agreement with Quadriant for a
mailing machine and mail sorting services.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES:
Resolution sponsored by Alderwoman Wray, seconded
by Alderman Tobin. Any discussion? Roll.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Tobin?

ALDERMAN SPARROW TOBIN: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Jean-
Francois?

ALDERMAN JUDE JEAN-FRANCOIS: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Johnson?

ALDERMAN PAUL JOHNSON: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Wray?

ALDERWOMAN KATE WRAY: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Kleiner?

ALDERMAN GERALD KLEINER: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Green?

ALDERMAN ANDREW GREEN: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Witt?

ALDERMAN KEVIN WITT: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Masi?

ALDERMAN JOSEPH MASI: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: President
Rodrigues?

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Carries.
Resolution sponsored by Alderman Green
authorizing an amendment to City Code Chapter
475-30 to provide the planning board with further
discretion regarding renewals of permits for
temporary businesses and movable structures.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES:
Resolution sponsored by Alderman Green, seconded
by Alderman Kleiner. Any discussion? Roll.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Tobin?

ALDERMAN SPARROW TOBIN: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Jean-
Francois?

ALDERMAN JUDE JEAN-FRANCOIS: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Johnson?

ALDERMAN PAUL JOHNSON: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Wray?

ALDERWOMAN KATE WRAY: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Kleiner?

ALDERMAN GERALD KLEINER: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Green?

ALDERMAN ANDREW GREEN: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Witt?

ALDERMAN KEVIN WITT: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Masi?

ALDERMAN JOSEPH MASI: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: President
Rodrigues?

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Carries.

Resolution sponsored by Alderman Kleiner
authorizing an award of a bid for ornamental
street poles to Kandel Brothers.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES:
Resolution sponsored by Alderman Kleiner,
seconded by Alderman Green. Any discussion?
Roll.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Tobin?

ALDERMAN SPARROW TOBIN: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Jean-
Francois?

ALDERMAN JUDE JEAN-FRANCOIS: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Johnson?

ALDERMAN PAUL JOHNSON: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Wray?

ALDERWOMAN KATE WRAY: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Kleiner?

ALDERMAN GERALD KLEINER: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Green?

ALDERMAN ANDREW GREEN: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Witt?

ALDERMAN KEVIN WITT: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Masi?

ALDERMAN JOSEPH MASI: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: President
Rodrigues?

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Carries.

Resolution sponsored by Alderman Masi authorizing
the reappointment of Ross Mastria as deputy
commissioner of Public Works.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES:
Resolution sponsored by Alderman Masi, seconded
by Alderman Green. Any discussion? Roll.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Tobin?

ALDERMAN SPARROW TOBIN: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Jean-
Francois?

ALDERMAN JUDE JEAN-FRANCOIS: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Johnson?

ALDERMAN PAUL JOHNSON: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Wray?

ALDERWOMAN KATE WRAY: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Kleiner?

ALDERMAN GERALD KLEINER: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Green?

ALDERMAN ANDREW GREEN: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Witt?

ALDERMAN KEVIN WITT: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Masi?

ALDERMAN JOSEPH MASI: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: President

Rodrigues?

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Carries.

Resolution sponsored by Alderman Witt authorizing the reappointment of Brian Smith as the deputy commissioner of Public Works.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES:

Resolution sponsored by Alderman Witt, seconded by Alderman Kleiner. Any discussion? Roll.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Tobin?

ALDERMAN SPARROW TOBIN: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Jean-Francois?

ALDERMAN JUDE JEAN-FRANCOIS: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Johnson?

ALDERMAN PAUL JOHNSON: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Wray?

ALDERWOMAN KATE WRAY: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Kleiner?

ALDERMAN GERALD KLEINER: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Green?

ALDERMAN ANDREW GREEN: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Witt?

ALDERMAN KEVIN WITT: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Masi?

ALDERMAN JOSEPH MASI: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: President Rodrigues?

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Carries.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Local law.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: We have Local Law Number 1 of 2025 this evening, Written Notice of Defect sponsored by Alderman Johnson.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Can I

have a second?

ALDERMAN ANDREW GREEN: Aye.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Second
Alderman Green. Any discussion? Roll.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Tobin?

ALDERMAN SPARROW TOBIN: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Jean-
Francois?

ALDERMAN JUDE JEAN-FRANCOIS: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Johnson?

ALDERMAN PAUL JOHNSON: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Wray?

ALDERWOMAN KATE WRAY: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Kleiner?

ALDERMAN GERALD KLEINER: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Green?

ALDERMAN ANDREW GREEN: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Witt?

ALDERMAN KEVIN WITT: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Masi?

ALDERMAN JOSEPH MASI: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: President
Rodrigues?

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Carries.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Audit?

MAN 10: Mr. President, I move the accounts be audited, the claims be adjusted and the city treasurer be authorized to issue warrants for their payment.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES:

Resolution sponsored by Alderman Masi, seconded

--

ALDERMAN PAUL JOHNSON: Second.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: -- by Alderman Johnson. Roll.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Tobin?

ALDERMAN SPARROW TOBIN: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Jean-Francois?

ALDERMAN JUDE JEAN-FRANCOIS: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Johnson?

ALDERMAN PAUL JOHNSON: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Wray?

ALDERWOMAN KATE WRAY: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Kleiner?

ALDERMAN GERALD KLEINER: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Green?

ALDERMAN ANDREW GREEN: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Witt?

ALDERMAN KEVIN WITT: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Masi?

ALDERMAN JOSEPH MASI: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: President
Rodrigues?

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Aye.

CLERK RICHARD MCCORMACK: Carries.

PRESIDENT J. MIGUEL RODRIGUES: Move
for adjournment?

MAN 10: Moved.

(Adjourned)

C E R T I F I C A T I O N

I, Sonya Ledanski Hyde, certify that the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate record of the proceedings.



Sonya M. Ledanski Hyde

Veritext Legal Solutions

330 Old Country Road

Suite 300

Mineola, NY 11501

Date: April 11, 2025